

## Philosophy of Logic

Fall 2002 - Winter 2003

Our goal over these two quarters is to think through a series of possible positions on the nature of logical truth. We will focus on the most fundamental questions: what is the ground of logical truth? (what makes logical truths true?), and how do we come to know these truths? I have in mind here the simplest of logical truths -- if it's either red or green and it's not red, then it must be green -- or the simplest of logical validities -- any situation in which all men are mortal and Socrates is a man is a situation in which Socrates is mortal.

This is a reading course in format, which leaves us the flexibility to spend more or less time on various views and writers as we go along and leaves you the freedom to pause and focus more intensely on any of the topics we survey in passing. Here's a tentative list of readings.

### Topics

#### 1. A Kantian view of logic

Maddy, 'Logic and the discursive intellect'.

(Unfortunately, chronological order puts one of the very hardest views first. We'll all need to dip into the relevant parts of the *Critique*. For a capsule Kant and references, you might look at 'Naturalism and the a priori', pp. 92-102. For beginners, Körner's *Kant* can be helpful.)

#### 2. Naturalized Kant

Maddy, 'A naturalistic look at logic'.

(For some background on naturalism, see 'Naturalism: friends and foes' and/or 'Three forms of naturalism'.)

#### 3. Bolzano

Bolzano, *Theory of Science*, §§12, 13, 16, 19, 20, 25, 30, 48-50, 54, 56, 61, 68, 72-75, 78, 101, 123, 148, 186, 305, 315.

(Proust, *Questions of Form*, chapter 2, discusses Bolzano's notion of analyticity. See also 'From Kant to Boole', §III, for discussion and references.)

#### 4. Mill

Mill, *System of Logic*, Book I, Chapter VI, and Book II, Chapters I-III, VII.5.

(See also 'From Kant to Boole', §IV, for discussion and references.)

#### 5. Boole

Boole, *The Laws of Thought*, chapters I, II, XXII, and §III.15.

(See also 'From Kant to Boole', §V, for discussion and references.)

#### 6. Frege

Frege, *Posthumous Writings*, pp. 2-7, 128-138, 267-274.  
'The thought'.

(Frege gets a Platonistic reading, e.g., from Burge, 'Frege on knowing the third realm', and a Kantian reading from many, beginning with Sluga's *Gottlob Frege*.)

#### 7. Early Wittgenstein

Wittgenstein, *Tractatus*, (Ogden translation), especially 1-6.13.

First meeting: 1-3.3.

Second meeting: 3.3-5.01.

Third meeting: 5.1-5.135, 5.1363-5.143, 5.3-5.5571, 6-6.13. (For philosophy of math, see 6.2-6.241.)

For help, try Mounce, *Wittgenstein's Tractatus*, and/or Black, *A Companion to Wittgenstein's Tractatus*. Also worth a look at this point are Anscombe, *An Introduction to Wittgenstein's Tractatus*, and

Goldfarb, 'Objects, names and realism in the *Tractatus*', pp. 1-22.

Summerfield, 'Thought and language in the *Tractatus*'.

Fourth meeting: the rest of the *Tractatus*, and

Stenius, 'Wittgenstein as Kantian philosopher', *Wittgenstein's Tractatus*, chapter XI.

Summerfield, 'Wittgenstein on logical form and Kantian geometry'.

(For those who can't get enough Kantianism, here are a couple other relevant pieces:

Kannisto, *Thoughts and their Subject*, pp. 114-130.

Garver, 'Wittgenstein and the critical tradition'.)

Fifth meeting: the new Wittgenstein.

Diamond, 'Throwing away the ladder: how to read the *Tractatus*', in her *The Realistic Spirit*, chapter 6.

Goldfarb, 'Metaphysics and nonsense: on Cora Diamond's *The Realistic Spirit*', and/or

'Das Überwinden: anti-metaphysical readings of the *Tractatus*', unpublished ms.

Proops, 'The New Wittgenstein: a critique'.

## 8. Carnap/Quine

First meeting:

Carnap, *Logical Syntax of Language*, §§1, 2, 17, 50-52, 62, 71-73.  
'Empiricism, semantics and ontology'.

Quine, 'Truth by convention'.

Second meeting:

Quine, 'Two dogmas of empiricism'.  
'Carnap and logical truth'.

(Quine's empiricism gets a particular case in Putnam's 'Is logic empirical?', but many of you will hear about this in David's 'Probability and determinism'. Quine's views softened somewhat in later years. See *Philosophy of Logic*, chapters 6 and 7, and *Pursuit of Truth*, §6.)

Friedman, 'Analytic truth in Carnap's *Logical Syntax of Language*', chapter 7 of his *Reconsidering Logical Positivism*.

Third meeting:

Friedman, 'Tolerance and analyticity in Carnap's philosophy of mathematics', chapter 9 of his *Reconsidering Logical Positivism*.

Richardson, *Carnap's Construction of the World*, chapter 1, pp. 198-206, and chapter 9.

## 9. Late Wittgenstein

First meeting:

Wittgenstein, *Philosophical Investigations*, §§109-133, 185-243. (§§243-317 is the private language argument.)

*Remarks on the Foundations of Mathematics*, Part I, §§1-23, 113-156.

Second meeting:

Stroud, 'Wittgenstein and logical necessity'.

Canfield, 'Anthropological science fiction and logical necessity'.

Third meeting:

Kripke, *Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language*, pp. 1-113.

(Kripke sees Wittgenstein as putting forward a new skeptical paradox and a skeptical solution to it. This skeptical solution in turn generates an argument against the possibility of a private language.)

Fourth meeting:

Blackburn, 'The individual strikes back'.

Hoffman, 'Kripke on private language'.

(These two question the effectiveness of Kripke's skeptical solution.)

Summerfield, 'Philosophical Investigations 201: a Wittgensteinian reply to Kripke'.

Fifth meeting:

Goldfarb, 'Kripke on Wittgenstein on rules', especially §III.

Diamond, 'Realism and the realistic spirit', chapter 1 of *The Realistic Spirit*.

Maddy, 'Wittgenstein's anti-philosophy of mathematics'.

(These three outline an interpretation of Wittgenstein at the extreme opposite from Kripke's, an interpretation pioneered by Diamond, Goldfarb and others.)

### Bibliography

Anscombe, G. E. M.

[1959] *An Introduction to Wittgenstein's Tractatus*,  
(Philadelphia, PA: U. of Pennsylvania Press).

Ayer, A. J.

[1956] 'The a priori', reprinted in reprinted in P.  
Benacerraf and H. Putnam, eds., *Philosophy of  
Mathematics*, second edition, (Cambridge: Cambridge  
University Press, 1983), pp. 315-328.

Black, Max

[1964] *A Companion to Wittgenstein's Tractatus*, (Ithaca, NY:  
Cornell University Press).

Blackburn, Simon

[1984] 'The individual strikes back', *Synthese* 58, pp. 281-  
301.

Bolzano, Bernard

[1873] *Theory of Science*, R. George, trans., (Berkeley:  
University of California Press, 1972).

Boole, George

[1852] *The Laws of Thought*, (New York: Dover, 1958).

Burge, Tyler

[1992] 'On knowing the third realm', *Mind* 101, pp. 633-650.

Canfield, John

- [1975] 'Anthropological science fiction and logical necessity', *Canadian Journal of Philosophy* 4, pp. 105-117.

Carnap, Rudolf

- [1937] *The Logical Syntax of Language*, A. Smeaton, trans., (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul).
- [1950] 'Empiricism, semantics, and ontology', in P. Benacerraf and H. Putnam, eds., *Philosophy of Mathematics*, second edition, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983), pp. 241-257.

Diamond, Cora

- [1991] *The Realistic Spirit*, (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press).

Frege, Gottlob

- [1919] 'The Thought', reprinted in M. Beaney, *The Frege Reader*, (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1997), pp. 325-345.

Friedman, Michael

- [1999] *Reconsidering Logical Positivism*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press).

Garver, Newton

- [1990] 'Wittgenstein and the critical tradition', *History of Philosophy Quarterly* 7, pp. 227-240.

Goldfarb, Warren

- [1979] 'Objects, names, and realism in the *Tractatus*', unpublished.
- [1985] 'Kripke on Wittgenstein on rules', *Journal of Philosophy* 82, pp. 471-488.
- [1997] 'Metaphysics and nonsense: on Cora Diamond's *The Realistic Spirit*', *Journal of Philosophical Research* 22, pp. 57-73.
- [????] 'Das Überwinden: anti-metaphysical readings of the *Tractatus*', unpublished ms.

Hoffman, Paul

- [1985] 'Kripke on private language', *Philosophical Studies* 47, pp. 23-28.

Kannisto, Heikki

- [1986] *Thoughts and their Subject: A Study of Wittgenstein's Tractatus*, Acta Philosophica Fennica, vol. 40, (Helsinki: Philosophical Society of Finland, 1986).

Kant, Immanuel

- [1878] *Critique of Pure Reason*, P. Guyer and A. Wood, eds. and trans., (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997).

Körner, Stephan

- [1955] *Kant*, (Baltimore, MD: Penguin Books).

Kripke, Saul

- [1982] *Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language*, (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press).

Maddy, Penelope

- [1993] 'Wittgenstein's anti-philosophy of mathematics', in K. Puhl, ed., *Wittgenstein's Philosophy of Mathematics*, (Vienna: Hölder-Pichler-Tempsky), pp. 52-72.
- [1999] 'Logic and the discursive intellect', *NDJFL* 40 (1999), pp. 94-115.
- [2000] 'Naturalism and the a priori', In P. Boghossian and C. Peacocke, eds., *New Essays on the A Priori*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), pp. 92-116.
- [2001] 'Naturalism: friends and foes', in J. Tomberlin, ed., *Philosophical Perspectives 15, Metaphysics 2001*, (Madlen, MA: Blackwell, 2001), pp. 37-67.
- [2002] 'A naturalistic look at logic', *Proceedings of the APA*, November 2002.
- [200?] 'Three forms of naturalism', to appear in S. Shapiro, ed., *Oxford Handbook of Philosophy of Logic and Mathematics*.
- [xxxx] 'From Kant to Boole', unpublished ms.

Mill, John Stuart

[1983] *A System of Logic*, (London: Longmans, 1959).

Mounce, H. O.

[1981] *Wittgenstein's Tractatus: An Introduction*, (Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press).

Proops, Ian

[2001] 'The New Wittgenstein: a critique', *European Journal of Philosophy* 9, pp. 375-404.

Proust, Joëlle

[1989] *Questions of Form: Logic and the Analytic Proposition from Kant to Carnap*, (Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press).

Quine, W. V. O.

[1936] 'Truth by convention', reprinted in reprinted in P. Benacerraf and H. Putnam, eds., *Philosophy of Mathematics*, second edition, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983), pp. 329-376.

[1951] 'Two dogmas of empiricism', reprinted in his *From a Logical Point of View*, second edition, (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1980), pp. 20-46.

[1954] 'Carnap and logical truth', reprinted in P. Benacerraf and H. Putnam, eds., *Philosophy of Mathematics*, second edition, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983), pp. 355-376.

[1986] *Philosophy of Logic*, second edition, (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press).

[1990] *Pursuit of Truth*, (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press).

Richardson, Alan

[1998] *Carnap's Construction of the World: The Aufbau and the Emergence of Logical Positivism*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press).

Sluga, Hans

[1980] *Gottlob Frege*, (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul).

Stenius, Eric

[1960] *Wittgenstein's Tractatus*, (Oxford: Basil Blackwell).

Stroud, Barry

[1965] 'Wittgenstein and logical necessity', reprinted in P. Moser, ed., *A Priori Knowledge*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1987), pp. 68-84.

Summerfield, Donna

[1990] 'Wittgenstein on logical form and Kantian geometry', *Dialogue* 29, pp. 531-550.

[1990a] 'Philosophical Investigations 201: A Wittgensteinian reply to Kripke', *Journal of the History of Philosophy* 28, pp. 417-438.

[1992] 'Thought and language in the *Tractatus*', *Midwest Studies in Philosophy* 17, pp. 224-245.

Wittgenstein, Ludwig

[1922] *Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus*, C. K. Ogden, trans., (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul).

[1953] *Philosophical Investigations*, (New York: MacMillan).

[1933/44] *Remarks on the Foundations of Mathematics*, G. H. von Wright et al, eds., G. E. M. Anscombe, trans., (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1978).